

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA**

YAMIL LUNA GUTIERREZ, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs, on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

V.

KRISTI NOEM, Secretary of Homeland Security, in
her official capacity, *et al.*,

Defendants.

No. 1:25-cv-01766-SLS

PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY

Plaintiffs respectfully submit this Notice of Supplemental Authority to inform the Court of a memorandum opinion issued by another judge in this District in *Florence Immigrant and Refugee Rights Project v. U.S. Dep’t of Homeland Sec.* (“*FIRRP*”), No. 1:22-cv-3118-CKK, 2025 WL 2844538 (D.D.C. Oct. 6, 2025), attached hereto, which supports Plaintiffs’ opposition to Defendants’ pending Motion to Dismiss.

In its opinion, the court denied the government’s motion to dismiss, and concluded that Plaintiffs stated a valid claim that restrictions on attorney access for immigrant detainees held at the Florence Correctional Center were punitive, in violation of their Fifth Amendment right to substantive due process. *Id.* at *8-*12. The court concluded that detained immigrants can establish unconstitutional punishment “by showing that there is an expressed intent to punish, or that the challenged conditions are either not rationally related to a legitimate nonpunitive governmental purpose or excessive in relation to that purpose.” *Id.* at *5 (cleaned up) (quoting *Kingsley v. Hendrickson*, 576 U.S. 389, 398 (2015)). The court also concluded that “[w]here conditions at a detention facility are ‘not more considerate than those at pretrial and prison

facilities,’ they ‘may be punitive in nature.’” *Id.* (quoting *S. Poverty L. Ctr. v. U.S. Dep’t of Homeland Sec. (SPLC I)*, No. 18-cv-0760, 2020 WL 3265533, at *18 (D.D.C. June 17, 2020)).

Plaintiffs in this case likewise allege that their detention at Guantánamo is unconstitutionally punitive, under the same tests articulated by the *FIRRP* court. *See* ECF No. 33 at 38–43.

##

Dated: October 16, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

Eunice H. Cho (D.C. Bar No. 1708073)
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
915 15th Street, NW, 7th Floor
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 546-6616
echo@aclu.org

My Khanh Ngo (D.C. Bar No. CA00219)
Kyle Virgien*
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
425 California Street, Suite 700
San Francisco, CA 94104
(415) 343-0770
mngo@aclu.org
kvirgien@aclu.org

Arthur B. Spitzer (D.C. Bar No. 235960)
Scott Michelman (D.C. Bar No. 1006945)
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION OF THE DISTRICT OF
COLUMBIA
529 14th Street, NW, Suite 722
Washington, D.C. 20045
(202) 457-0800
aspitzer@acludc.org
smichelman@acludc.org

Deepa Alagesan (D.D.C. Bar No. NY0261)
Kimberly Grano (D.D.C. Bar No. NY0512)
INTERNATIONAL REFUGEE
ASSISTANCE PROJECT
One Battery Park Plaza, 33rd Floor
New York, New York 10004
(516) 838-7044
dalagesan@refugeerights.org
kgrano@refugeerights.org

/s/ Lee Gelernt
Lee Gelernt (D.D.C. Bar No. NY0408)
Brett Max Kaufman (D.D.C. Bar No.
NY0224)
Judy Rabinovitz*
Noor Zafar*
Omar C. Jadwat*
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor
New York, NY 10004
(212) 549-2660
lgelernt@aclu.org
bkaufman@aclu.org
jrabinovitz@aclu.org
nzafar@aclu.org
ojadwat@aclu.org

Wafa Junaid*
NEW YORK CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION
FOUNDATION
125 Broad Street, 19th Floor
New York, NY 10004
(212) 607-3376
wjunaid@nyclu.org

Baher Azmy**
Shayana D. Kadidal (D.C. Bar No. 454248)
J. Wells Dixon**
CENTER FOR CONSTITUTIONAL
RIGHTS
666 Broadway, Floor 7
New York, NY 10012
(212) 614-6427
bazmy@ccrjustice.org
shanek@ccrjustice.org
wdixon@ccrjustice.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs-Petitioners

**Appearing under certificate of pro bono
representation*

***Pro bono representation certificates
forthcoming*